

E.R.

CMC(SG)(2)(89)

SECOND MEETING OF THE CMC STATISTICS SUB-GROUP ON 23 MAY AT 1000:
ESTABLISHMENT OF A SECURITY ENVIRONMENT DATABASE

Agenda

1. Chairman's Report: matters arising (including Data Protection Act - Mr Beckett).
2. Statistics on NI Security Environment - paper by Statistics Branch.
3. Security Environment Database - paper by LOB.
4. Any other business.

BB 8841

RESTRICTED

STATISTICS ON NI SECURITY ENVIRONMENT

1. At a meeting on 16 March 1989, NIO Statistics Branch was tasked with reviewing the information available on various aspects of the Northern Ireland security environment. This paper outlines progress to date, makes some recommendations and suggestions, and indicates possible next steps.

2. The review has involved discussions with

NIO - Law and Order division
Police division
Maryfield secretariat
ISU
Civil representatives

RUC - Statistics branch
Complaints and discipline

PANI - Compensation claims

ICPC

HQNI - Civil advisor
Operational statistics branch
Vehicle computer section
Legal process office
Search unit
Explosives ordnance division
Area claims office
Central criminal records information office

and has covered

- (a) security incidents
- (b) indicators of army activity
- (c) complaints, compensation claims and civil litigation arising from army and RUC activity.

RESTRICTED

SECURITY INCIDENTS

3. There is considerable interest in NIO, HQNI and RUC in data on security incidents - armed robberies, explosions, shootings, public disorder, finds etc. Each organisation requires access to individual incident based information and aggregate statistics to respond to information requests on the security situation, to confirm or refute statements made by politicians etc, and to assist in formulating policy.
4. The basis for security information/statistics are the daily situation reports and the daily RUC duty officer's reports, both circulated to all interested parties. The RUC and HQNI also have resource to more detailed incident reports as necessary. Details of each incident are extracted and processed as follows.
 - (a) At HQNI textual information and statistical data (including location) are recorded on a customised computerised database. The system contains each incident from 1978 up to (generally) about 1-2 weeks ago. It is routinely revised to take account of the latest information eg. detailed investigation reports on explosives and deaths arising from a previously recorded incident. The hardware/software configuration in use is best suited to an information retrieval role on specific incidents, but can be used to provide some statistics on both a regular and ad-hoc basis. The statistics produced are the basis of a weekly press briefing.
 - (b) At RUC headquarters statistics are manually collated, though a computerised system is currently being developed to provide both incident based information retrieval and statistical data. The range of statistical data incorporated will be similar to that recorded by HQNI, though textual information will differ in emphasis. By virtue of being hosted on a more powerful machine the RUC system should be better suited to the production of regular statistics than that at HQNI, but ad-hoc analysis may prove equally cumbersome. The RUC computer system will not contain historic data.
 - (c) NIO's use of the daily reports is confined to the incident information role. For statistics, reliance is on the regular outputs of the RUC and HQNI. The availability of historic statistical data within NIO is not only constrained by the scope of these regular outputs, but is further dependant on the idiosyncracies of the way in which they are filed in LOB. (Some development work has been done by the ISU to provide a filing/data transmission system on BLIS, but this is not yet ready to be implemented)

RESTRICTED

5. Whether because of incompatible requirements (not convincing), lack of appropriate communication and IT facilities (more likely), or some other reasons, there are separate information retrieval/statistical systems in operation in HQNI/RUC. The effect on incident information retrieval may not extend beyond duplication of effort; but for statistics there is also scope for confusion, embarrassment and loss of public confidence if the two systems are not in agreement. In recognition of this strenuous efforts are made by HQNI/RUC statistics branches to cross-check their data, but some discrepancies still occur.
6.
 - (a) IT IS RECOMMENDED that efforts should be made to design and implement a single information/statistical system to meet HQNI, RUC and NIO needs. Co-operation of all parties would be essential.
 - (b) In the interim (or for longer if such an initiative fails) IT IS RECOMMENDED that for each aspect of the security situation (bombings, shootings, injuries etc) either HQNI or RUC should be agreed upon as the definitive source; and only data from that source would be made publically available.
 - (c) To satisfy NIO needs until such time as an agreed HQNI/RUC/NIO system might become available, IT IS RECOMMENDED that statistical records from the HQNI system be copied to NIO Statistics Branch computer. Historical records from 1978, and on-going updates on a monthly basis, are both covered by this recommendation.
 - (d) IT IS ALSO RECOMMENDED that the ISU, in liaison with Statistics Branch should continue their work to make current and historical data summaries available throughout NIO on spreadsheet.

INDICATORS OF ARMY ACTIVITY

7. During discussions at HQNI three potential indicators of army activity arose - location and frequency of patrols, search reports, and VENGEFUL.
 - (a) Whilst there are detailed records of patrol activity in the form of a patrol log, these only exist as uncollated manual records. There is some interest within HQNI (from Legal Process Office) in having them computerised to assist in their storage and retrieval, and should this happen, statistics could be developed as a by-product. The effort required to code and computerise some 400 - 500 logs per day would be substantial.

RESTRICTED

- (b) When a detailed property, vehicle or route search is undertaken a NISR (Northern Ireland Search Report) is completed. These documents have been fully computerised since 1984. Both textual and statistical information (including location of search) are included. However the primitive nature of the computer system means it has no statistical capability and can only be used for textual retrieval. To properly utilise the information would require extracts of the statistical data to be transferred to a more suitable computer (such as that in NIO Statistics branch) at regular intervals.
- IT IS SO RECOMMENDED, noting that HQNI itself would become a client for the statistical summaries.
- (c) It was suggested that VENGEFUL might be a source of information on army activity, but discussions revealed that this would not be the case. VENGEFUL records contacts between the army and vehicles ranging from a full search (when a NISR would be available), stop and question occupant, to a mere sighting. The system is not geared towards statistical analysis and the types of contact are not distinguishable.

COMPLAINTS, COMPENSATION AND CIVIL LITIGATION

8. Complaints against the security forces which are investigated for disciplinary reasons are an important measure of dissatisfaction with security force activity. But policy related complaints, compensation claims and civil litigations are also evidence of dissatisfaction/disruption which could directly impact on civilian/security force relationships. IT IS RECOMMENDED that in considering possible dissatisfaction with security force activity, due regard should be given to all possible measures, and this investigation has proceeded with this in mind.

Complaints against the RUC

9. A detailed investigation of complaints against police officers up to the rank of Chief Superintendent, as recorded by the RUC and ICPC, was undertaken recently and recommendations to harmonise and develop the statistics are being made in a separate report to Police Division. In the context of CMC the following points are relevant -
- (a) There are differences in ICPC and RUC statistics resulting from differences in timing, presentation and coverage. The most detailed analyses relate to completed investigations and IT WAS RECOMMENDED that RUC and ICPC should co-ordinate their efforts, with RUC taking the lead.

RESTRICTED

- (b) Many cases take more than a year to process, so that the data on complaints investigated is somewhat dated from the point of view of assessing current trends in type and volume of complaints. More emphasis should be put on analysing cases received and IT WAS RECOMMENDED that a case based system be set up based on ICPC records.
10. The formal RUC/ICPC complaints recording mechanisms exclude complaints against senior officers (dealt with by PANI) and against RUC operational/policy decisions. The availability of data on such cases has not been investigated, though the numbers involved are 'reported' to be small.

Complaints against the army

11. Unlike the situation for complaints against the RUC, there is not a well developed system for recording and analysing complaints against the army. Data started to be collated less than a year ago, at the request of CMC.
- (a) Non-criminal complaints received in writing by NIO (LOB or Maryfield secretariat), together with those sent directly to HQNI, are processed by the civil advisor. Since last June cases have been reported at an annual rate of around 300 and it is these that have formed the basis of CMC deliberation.
 - (b) 'Informal' non-criminal complaints are dealt with by the civil representatives.
 - (c) Complaints alledging criminal behaviour are passed to the appropriate RUC division for investigation. Computerised information exists within CCIRO on those cases where the military police have been asked to assist RUC investigations. CCIRO records show about 150 per year, but it is not known what proportion this would be of the overall total. These data have not been considered by CMC.
 - (d) As with the RUC, complaints of an operational/policy nature (eg. against siting of road blocks, search damage or helicopter noise) have not been collated. The impression received is that this category is much more relevant to army than to RUC operations. Apart from those which are also associated with compensation claims, there are probably at least several hundred per year.

RESTRICTED

Compensation claims

12. The table below lists various types of compensation claims by the public arising out of army/RUC activities, indicating the authority ultimately responsible. In many cases the civil representatives of NIO are involved. Some claims are unrelated to the security situation, but many are, and could have a direct impact on civilian/security force relationships. Some will have generated an identifiable complaint as referred to above.

ORGANISATION	TYPE OF CLAIM
PSA	land acquisitions for VCPs, PVCs etc
MOD/ACO (NI and London)	aircraft and helicopter noise injury from army assault army operations - land damage army shootings and PBRs (public liability at army bases)?
NIO	EPA searches craters army patrol damage (criminal damage compensation)?
PANI	controlled explosions arising from bomb scares injury from RUC assault RUC shootings and PBRs (public liability at RUC stations)?
DOE	ramps and barriers on public roads
Commercial Insurers	(army vehicle accident damage)? (police vehicle accident damage)?

13. Investigations covering the majority of those listed, show that available statistics are limited and have no geographic dimension, but that case based information is.

RESTRICTED

Overview

14. In order to identify patterns and trends in dissatisfaction/disruption IT IS RECOMMENDED that a computerised statistical system be set up, covering all types of complaints and compensation claims arising out of army/RUC activities. (Vehicle accident damage is a possible exception) This could be achieved if each agency involved were to forward a weekly case-based return to Statistics Branch of all claims/complaints received. The form of such a return would be fixed, but could be tailored to fit the peculiarities of each of the various operational systems. Co-operation of all involved would be essential.
15. The computer system would be designed to identify cases recorded more than once, and could also allow for noting final action on each case. - In some cases the final action would not be known for some considerable time eg. in disputed compensation claims, or where a detailed police investigation was required.

Civil litigation

16. Both HQNI and RUC are involved in civil litigation resulting from their operations. On investigation it was realised that such action (almost) always follows disputed compensation claims, so that there is duplication of incidents already covered elsewhere.

RESTRICTED

SUMMARY AND CONSIDERATIONS FOR FURTHER ACTION

17. Statistics on security incidents are collated separately by HQNI and RUC. There is duplication of effort and, despite strenuous efforts, discrepancies can occur. An attempt should be made to obtain appropriate NIO/RUC/HQNI agreement either to the development of a common system using state of the art technology, or (second best) to the delineation of responsibilities for aspects of the data.
18. As an interim measure/fall back position NIO should seek formal agreement to the transfer of statistical details on security incidents from the HQNI system.
19. There is little readily available by way of statistics on the level of army activity, though patrol logs are an untapped source. An exception is army search records which are computerised for information retrieval purposes. Statistical analysis could be undertaken on Statistics Branch computer, with HQNI agreement, and provided they have no IT constraints.
20. The review has not looked at possible indicators of RUC activity. Information will exist in some form on RUC searches but consideration of same might be best left in abeyance until the way ahead is clear on indicators of army activity.
21. A case based complaints/compensation statistical system could be set up centrally in Statistics Branch, due regard being paid to the need to eliminate duplication. Co-operation of the various agencies involved would be necessary to provide appropriate case based data.
22. The systems proposed each have IT implications for Statistics Branch. Individually the impact might be manageable but collectively there would be a requirement for additional hardware/software. A review of IT strategy for the branch is about to take place, and this could take account of CMC requirements.

Roland Beckett

SECURITY ENVIRONMENT DATA-BASE: AN OUTLINE - PAPER FOR DISCUSSION
BY LOB

Objective: the need for a Data-base

1. The NIO produces a considerable volume of statistical and other information concerned with the security situation in Northern Ireland (eg in LOB alone, daily SitReps, monthly PTA statistics, length of remand periods, answers to PQs). But the information is gathered from fairly disparate sources, and is not always readily accessible. Moreover, the task of collating different information about the security situation, and information over a historical period, can be particularly laborious; while detailed analysis of the data is expensive in staff time. It should however be possible to harness the improving information technology of the office both to improve the recording of information within divisions, and to draw wider statistical inferences about the security environment as a whole with a view to assisting in policy formulation. One additional application of this would be to enable the Complaints Monitoring Committee to monitor more effectively the pattern of complaints against the security forces in relation to geographical areas, to the units involved, and to security force activity as a whole. But other applications are suggested below; indeed, once a database is established, its usefulness should grow on an evolutionary basis.

The Problem

2. The data-base will need to hold and collate speedily a wide range of information about the total security environment in Northern Ireland in such a way as to allow the information to

be drawn together intelligently. The information will come from a variety of sources and will not automatically be compatible: for example aggregated statistics from the RUC, ICPC, HQNI; individual cases from the Secretariat LOB CIVREPS; numerical and descriptive data; information with a specific or general geographical basis. The data-base needs to sort this out consistently and be capable of cross-referencing.

A possible model for dealing with Complaints

3. A 'standardised' form for recording complaints was discussed at the first meeting of the sub-group (Annex A, slightly modified). This could relatively easily be reproduced on a data-base, and would allow complaints to be logged in and sorted. One way of widening the data-base would be to produce two similar "menus" for security force activity and terrorist activity. A suggested format for these is attached, (Annex B and C). To log into the data-base, the operator would choose which of the three menus was relevant, ie:

Type of Activity? - Complaints
 Terrorist activity
 Security Force activity

and the relevant menu would come up, allowing the information to be fed in.

Time and Place

4. It was agreed that the data-base will primarily be concerned with sorting data on a chronological and geographical basis and that there would be no attempt, in view of the volume of data involved, to obtain information on a detailed basis before the new system came into operation; but the basic security statistics (murders, injuries etc) from 1969 would be included (Annex D).

5. There is clearly a difficulty in defining geographical areas for the purposes of the data-base, which can be alternately precise and general. One solution would be to enter about 50-60 specific geographical areas sized according to the general volume of activity in each areas: thus, North Down, North Antrim, West Belfast, Newry, Portadown etc. The data-base could then be programmed to associate specific locations with broader areas, thus:

39 Brigade = Lisburn + Antrim + Portadown etc
or Fermanagh = Lisnaskea + Enniskillen etc

and similarly for RUC Divisional areas TAORs.

This would allow the data-base to cross-reference data such as eg, 1,421 vehicles checked in 3 Brigade area with eg, 3 complaints of delays at VCPs in Crossmaglen.

What kind of information could be drawn out?

6. The value of such a data-base depends considerably on the quality and consistency with which information is fed in: there is obviously limited use in feeding in only some security incidents (such as appear on daily Sitreps). Similarly, it is important that information on complaints against the police should if possible be as specific as that relating to complaints against the Army.
7. But, as a minimum, the database should be able to supply the following kinds of information:
- (1) How many complaints in total from 1 to 31 March 1989?
 - (2) List complaints against Army in South Armagh
Jan 1 - April 31 1989.
 - (3) List terrorist activity; SF activity; complaints in
3 Brigade area 1 to 31 March 1989.

- (4) How many murders in Newry 1969 - 1989? List them.
- (5) List complaints involving UDR in Jan - June 1989.
- (6) What happened on 1 February 1989?
- (7) On what date was Judge Gibson murdered? etc

Defining the Security Forces

8. It will also be necessary to programme the data-base to sort out information about the Security Forces. Thus:

RUC = RUC Regular + RUC Reserve

Army = UDR + Regular Army + Other

Regular Army = 1 Para + 1 RIR + 42 Comm., etc.

What information needs to be fed in

9. A suggested list is:

- (1) Information extracted from daily Sitreps (both security incidents and SF activity).
- (2) Details of complaints received against SF by LOB, Secretariat, HQNI, CIVREPs.
- (3) Details of complaints received against police by RUC/ICPC.
- (4) Army deployment: force levels by area.
- (5) Number of vehicle checks, house searches (from Army Operational Reports).

Resource Implications

10. There would almost certainly be resource implications in this proposal: in effect, a fairly permanent operator (based, presumably in Statistics Branch) to gather and feed in information on a daily and monthly basis.

Conclusion

11. The sub-group is invited to consider whether the above represents a basis for further work on establishing a Security Environment database; how existing methods of collecting statistics within the NIO might be integrated into such a database; and what further functions a database of this kind might serve.

LAW AND ORDER DIVISION

19 May 1989

8777

COMPLAINTS AGAINST THE SECURITY FORCES

Ref No.	Name of Individual	Representation made by	Location	Security forces involved	Allegation	Outcome	Outcome Interim/final
	-individual	-Dungannon		-RUC	-continual stop/search	-resolved informally	
	-solicitor	-Corkederg		-UDR (4 UDR, 8 UDR etc.)	-body search	-referred to HQMI	
	-clergy	-W. Belfast		-Regular Army	-car search	-referred to police/ICPC	
	-elected rep.	-S. Anagh		1 Para	-house search	-referred to DPP	
	-media	-etc.		1 RIR	-VCP delays	-prosecution	
				42 Comm. etc	-detention	-financial compensation	
	-A-1 Secretariat			-unspecified/ unidentified	-intimidation	-allegation disproved/ rejected	
					-verbal abuse	-apology	
					-removal of clothing/ shoes	-not substantiated	
					assault		
					-death threat		
					-threat of arrest		
					-threat to relatives		
					-damage to property/		
					-livestock		
					-inducements for information		
					-collusion with paramilitaries		
					-distribution of offensive material		
					-interrogation		
					-continuous citation by SF		

SECURITY FORCE ACTIVITY

ANNEX B

DATE	LOCATION	SFs INVOLVED UNIT	TYPE OF ACTIVITY	DESCRIPTION/NUMBER
	- Dungannon	- RUC	- VIP	
	- Castlederg	- RUC (Reserve)	- Vehicle Checks	
	- W Belfast	- UDR	- House Searches	
	- S Armagh	- Regular Army	- Arrests made	
	- etc		- PBRs fired	
			- Firearms discharged	
			- Explosive/Weapons find	

BB 8763

ANNEX C

TERRORIST ACTIVITY

DATE	LOCATION	TYPE OF INCIDENT	ORGANISATION	NO. KILLED	NO. INJURED
	- Dungannon	- Car bomb	- PIRA		
	- Castlederg	- Shooting attack	- UFF		
	- W Belfast	- Riot	- IPLO		
	- S Armagh	- Prison breakout	- INLA		
	- etc	- Hijacking	- UVF		
		- Mortar attack	- UDA		
		- Punishment shooting	- Other/not known		

BB 8763

TERRORIST MURDERS

ANNEX D

DATE

LOCATION

NAME OF VICTIM(S)

RELIGION

OCCUPATION/
SECURITY FORCES

ORGANISATION

- Dungannon
- Castlederg
- W Belfast
- S Armagh
- etc

- PIRA
- INLA
- UVF
- UFF
- IPLO
- UDA
- Other/not
known

BB 8763