



An Chartlann Náisiúnta National Archives

Reference Code:	2021/93/48
Creator(s):	Department of the Taoiseach
Accession Conditions:	Open
Copyright:	National Archives, Ireland. May only be reproduced with the written permission of the Director of the National Archives.

(28)

Ministerial Meeting
Dublin, 31st May, 1991

Mr. Keogh
516.
Mr. Keogh
6 6 91

1. The Secretary of State was accompanied by Minister Mawhinney, John Chilcot, Joe Pilling, Quentin Thomas, Robert Alston and Ambassador Fenn. Ministers Collins and Burke were accompanied by Noel Dorr, Dermot Gallagher, Declan O' Donovan and Anne Anderson.
2. The meeting began at noon with a tete-a-tete between Ministers and a separate meeting of officials. This was followed by lunch (separate lunches for Ministers and officials) and a plenary session of about one hour in the afternoon. A summary of the tete-a-tete is attached at Annex 1; the plenary session is reported below. A separate report is being circulated on the pre-lunch meeting of officials.

Plenary

3. The Secretary of State noted there was now a meeting of minds at official level on the Procedural Guidelines. He said he would take responsibility for seeking to persuade the Unionists to accept them. If there was any degree of alteration or amendment proposed by the Unionists, the British side would come back to us on Monday afternoon. It would obviously be helpful - as a further milestone in the process - if agreement could be announced on Monday on the Procedural Guidelines and the agenda for Strand One.
4. On the question of the identity of the Chairman, Mr. Brooke asked whether we wished to give a preliminary reaction to the nine names proposed by the Unionists. (Note: the Unionist letter - Annex 2 - had arrived via the British Embassy just before lunch). As to the type of Chairman who would be suitable, Mr. Brooke said there was a difference of

approach between the two sides - basically the Irish side wanted more of a household name than the British did. The British feel that the higher the profile of the candidate, the more difficult it will be to persuade him to take the job and - if he accepts - to prevent him from taking over the process.

5. Responding to the latter point, the Minister said that there was no question of anyone taking over the process because the agreed Procedural Guidelines would prevent this. As to the type of person required, we believe the process needed a Chairman of personal and political stature who would have credibility and authority. The person in question had to be able to preside over meetings whose participants might include a Head of Government. We did not necessarily require a household name but he or she had to be a respected figure, ideally with a political and possibly also a legal background - a person who could not be pushed around by anyone and who would keep the process on an even keel.
6. Mr. Brooke asked what if we could not find such a person? Minister Burke said that finding a suitable person would surely not be beyond the joint capability of both Governments; both of us have extensive networks of Embassies which can be of assistance. Mr. Brooke said that the closer a person is to being a household name, the less likely he or she is to be available. The candidate would also need total fluency in English - Raymond Barre, for example, while he could comfortably intervene in English in informal discussions among Community Ministers, would have difficulty in presiding in English over forty-two people. The language requirement almost inevitably drives us back to English-speaking countries.
7. Minister Collins asked if the British side had specific names they wished to put to us. Mr. Brooke responded that

they had come with four names which he described as "similar in weight" to those put forward previously by them. The four individuals did not necessarily meet the criterion of being household names but they were people of experience and with a track record in their own fields. Picking up the Minister's earlier reference to legal expertise, he wondered if the Irish side might be happy with a lawyer who had some experience of public life?

8. Minister Collins reiterated that any Chairman must have authority and stature and must be able to command the respect of participants. A political background would help him to understand and relate to the participants in the process, who are themselves politicians. A political figure with some legal expertise would of course be very suitable.
9. Turning to the Unionist letter, Mr. Brooke said that the Unionists will press him on Monday for a reaction to their suggested names. Minister Collins said the response should be that the issue is too critical to give an immediate response. Mr. Brooke replied that he would then come under Unionist pressure as to when they can expect a reply. Minister Collins said that the question should not be entertained in these terms. The Unionists should be told that their suggestions will be given consideration by the two Governments in their overall search for a suitable Chairman. It was not simply a question of responding to Unionist suggestions - that would amount to handing over the management of the process to the Unionist leaders.
10. Mr. Brooke repeated that he would come under pressure from the Unionists and from the media to indicate when the Governments would have a name. Minister Collins said that the Governments had found a name which the Unionists had then vetoed; in the context of the crucially important

nature of the process, the views of leader writers were not of particular consequence.

11. Pressed further by Mr. Brooke as to when we might react to the names suggested by the Unionists, Minister Collins said that we would probably be in a position to give considered views by the end of next week. We would also consider putting forward some further names of our own at that time.
Mr. Brooke referred at this stage to the need for a joint deadline; Minister Collins responded that we had every intention of moving rapidly but there could be no question of a deadline - the British side could be assured that we would have regard to the urgency of the situation in all its aspects.
12. Mr. Brooke then circulated the four British names: George Thomson, Robert Carr, Patrick Neill and Lord Blake (see Annex 3 attached). He said they wished to retain Thomson's name (which had been on an earlier list) because they felt he was particularly suitable by virtue of personality and also because of his Cabinet and EC Commission experience. He added that Robert Carr commanded very wide personal respect.
13. Minister Collins said that we would give very careful consideration to these names and would come back to the British side, possibly - as indicated earlier - putting forward other suggestions also. Minister Mawhinney mentioned that at one point John Hume had suggested Piet Dankert (now a junior Minister in the Dutch Government). Both Mr. Brooke and Minister Collins said that, leaving aside the question of suitability, they had no information as to Mr. Dankert's availability.
14. Mr. Brooke said that he would like to feel there would be a series of "running exchanges" between us next week on the question of a Chairman. If there is a long delay, there

will inevitably be questions about the timeframe (although he emphasised there can be no question of changing the Conference scheduled for July 16th). It was important that both sides show a sense of urgency about the task of finding a Chairman. Minister Collins said that we expected to have a presentation ready for the British side at the meeting of the Liaison Group next Friday (7 June). We would at that stage, as he had said, have given consideration to the various names submitted and perhaps put forward our own names. In the interim, we could touch base at official level on Tuesday and maintain contact during the week.

15. Mr. Brooke said that, for his part, there would be a "nervousness" if we do not have a meeting of minds on Friday. "We will be in reasonably general collective trouble". Minister Collins responded that the essential point was that the two Governments had agreed a name; the Unionists had disgraced themselves totally in turning down Lord Carrington and the DUP submission today is a kind of mea culpa exercise. However, we welcomed their submission for what it is.
16. The meeting concluded following some discussion of comments to be made to the press.

A.A.

Anne Anderson
31 May, 1991.

cc: PST; PSM; Mr. Nally; PSS; Mr. Brosnan; Mr. Gallagher;
Ambassador London; Joint Secretary.

Report by Ministers Collins and Burke
on pre-lunch tete-a-tete

1. Minister Collins and Minister Burke said they had spoken at length about the pervasive mistrust and the poisonous atmosphere that now exists. It was extremely difficult to make progress in the full glare of publicity. A pause of up to two weeks would be helpful all round; the Unionists in particular need time to get their act together. The Unionists are trying to exercise a veto on a whole range of issues - they are even trying indirectly to veto a meeting between the Taoiseach and the Prime Minister. Unionist vetoes had blocked political progress in Northern Ireland for eighty years; progress is only possible if the right of veto is removed from them.
2. Mr. Brooke and Dr. Mawhinney said there will inevitably be some delay in getting a Chairman and this will in effect constitute a natural pause. However, both Governments must continue their intensive efforts to find a suitable candidate. The person in question would have to be consulted before his name was put to the parties. The British side felt it might be desirable to agree on two names so as to have a second one in reserve.
3. Mr. Brooke and Mr. Mawhinney had emphasised their belief that Hume is very foolish to have moved away from Stormont - this has given a propaganda weapon to the Unionists. Mr. Brooke added that he has had a personal education over the past five weeks about the problems of dealing with the Unionists. He heartily wished the 19 April document had been accepted and the Irish Government would then be able to see the difficulties at first hand! The real problem with Unionists is to "tie their heads and hearts together". One can convince them intellectually but their instincts and emotions pull them in a different direction.

NA.
31.5.91



Ulster Democratic Unionist Party

31st May 1991.

Dear Secretary of State,

In response to your invitation to supply names of possible Independent Chairmen for Strand 2 of our talks we suggest the following:-

Sir Frederick Catherwood
Lord Colnbrook
The Rt. Hon. Sir Zelman Cowen
Hon. Mr. Justice Enoch Dumbutshena
The Rt. Hon. Lord Havers
The Rt. Hon. Lord Lowry
The Rt. Hon. Merlyn Rees
The Rt. Hon. Lord Tonypandy
Professor Sir William Wade

We are aware of the purpose of your meeting in Dublin and therefore felt it would assist you in expeditiously dealing with this matter if we were to convey these names to you so that they could be placed before the Irish Government today.

Please confirm at your earliest convenience the result of your consultation on this list with the Irish Government today and upon your return your deliberations with the other participating delegations.

We emphasise again that this matter should be settled quickly since it is imperative that next week we can commence the plenary sessions of Strand 1.

Yours sincerely,

Dr. Ian R. K. Paisley M.P. M.E.P.

P.s. I have consulted Jim and he is in agreement SD

Annex 3.

3/5/91

Lord Thomson of Monifieth

Aged 70. Chancellor, Herriot-Watt University since 1977. Director of the Royal Bank of Scotland 1977-90. Variety of political appointments including: Secretary of State for Commonwealth Affairs 1967-68, Chancellor of the Duchy of Lancaster 1966-67, 1969-70. Chairman of the Labour Committee for Europe 1972-73. EEC Commissioner 1973-77. Numerous public appointments including Chairman of the Independent Broadcasting Authority 1981-88 and the Advertising Standards Authority 1977-80.

Lord Carr of Hadley

Aged 74. Conservative Home Secretary 1972-74. Secretary of State for Employment 1970-72. Lord President and Leader of the Commons 1972. Numerous Directorships, including Chairman of Prudential Assurance Co 1980-85. Chairman, Business in the Community 1984-87.

Sir Patrick Neill

Aged 65. Warden of All Souls College, Oxford. Vice-Chancellor, Oxford University 1985-89. Chairman of the Bar Council 1974-75. Chairman of the Press Council 1978-83. Led the Committee of Enquiry into regulatory arrangements at Lloyds 1986-87.

Lord Blake

Aged 74. Provost of The Queen's College, Oxford, 1968-87; Pro-Vice-Chancellor, Oxford University, 1971-87. Joint Editor, Dictionary of National Biography 1980-90. High Steward of Westminster Abbey, 1989-. Distinguished historian and biographer of Disraeli.

THOMSON, George Morgan, KT 1981; PC 1966; Chairman, Independent Broadcasting Authority, 1981-88 (Deputy Chairman, 1980); Chancellor, Heriot Watt University, since 1977; 816 Jan. 1921; 1st late James Thomson, Monifieth; m 1948, Grace Jenkins; two d. Educ: Grove Academy, Dundee. Served War of 1939-45, in Royal Air Force.

1940-46, Assistant Editor, Forward, 1946, Editor, 1948-53, Contributed (Lab) Glasgow, Hillhead, 1950; MP (Lab) Dundee East, July 1952-72; Joint Chm., Council for Education in the Commonwealth, 1953-64; Adviser to Educational Institute of Scotland, 1960-64; Minister of State, Foreign Office, 1964-66; Chancellor of the Duchy of Lancaster, 1966-67; Joint Minister of State, Foreign Office, 1967; Secretary of State for Commonwealth Affairs, Aug. 1967-Oct. 1968; Minister Without Portfolio, 1968-69; Chancellor of the Duchy of Lancaster, 1969-70; Shadow Defence Minister, 1970-72; Chm., Labour Ctee for Europe, 1972-73; Commissioner, EEC, 1973-Jan. 1977; Chairman, European Movement in Britain, 1977-80; Advertising Standards Authority, 1977-80; European TV and Film Forum, 1977-80; ICI plc, 1977-89; Woolwich Equitable Director; Royal Bank of Scotland, 1984-90; President: Hist. of Advertising Trust, 1985-; Building Soc. (Gen. Vice-Chm., 1984-90); President: Hist. of Advertising Trust, 1985-; Pricewaterhouse, 1989-; Dir. ENQ, 1987-; Chm., Surrey Lamplugh Trust, 1990-; Dep. Chm., Ditchley Foundn., 1983-87; Thomson Foundn., 1977-; Pilgrims Trust, 1977-; Treasurer, Leeds Castle Foundn., 1978-; Mem. SLD, 1989-; FRSE 1985; FRIS 1990 (Vice-Pres., 1982-89); Hon. LLD Dundee, 1967; Hon. DLitt: Heriot Watt, 1973; New Univ. of Ulster, 1984; Hon. DSE Aston, 1978. Address: House of Lords, SW1. Club: Brooks's.

CARR OF HADLEY, Baron 1975 (Life Peer), of Munken Hadley, (Leonard) Robert Carr, PC 1963; FIC, 811 Nov. 1916; 1st of late Ralph Edward and of Katie Elizabeth Carr; m 1943, Joan Kathleen, d. of Dr E. W. Twining, two d. (and one s. died). Educ: Westminster Sch.; Gonville and Caius Coll., Cambridge, BA Nat. Sci. Hon. 1938; MA 1942; FIM 1957; Joined John Dale Ltd. 1938 (Dir. 1948-55; Chm., 1958-63); Director: Metal Closures Group Ltd. 1964-70 (Dep. Chm., 1960-63 and 1st Man. Dir. 1960-63); Carr, Day & Martin Ltd. 1947-55; Isotope Developments Ltd. 1950-55; Metal Closures Ltd. 1959-63; Scottish Union & National Insurance Co. (London Bd), 1958-63; S. Inflation & Co., 1963, 1965-70, 1974-80; Security Ltd and Security Services PLC, 1961-63, 1965-70, 1974-85; SCIBIC PLC, 1974-86; Prudential Assurance Co., 1976-85 (Dep. Chm., 1979-80; Chm., 1980-85); Prudential Corporation PLC, 1978-89 (Dep. Chm., 1979-80; Chm., 1980-85); Cadbury Schweppes PLC, 1979-87; Chm., Strategy Ventures, 1988-; Mem., London Adv. Bd, Norwich Union Insurance Co., 1965-70, 1974-76; Member, Advisory Board: PA Strategy Partners, 1985-87; LEK Partnership, 1987-; Mem. Council, CDI, 1976-87 (Chm., Educ. and Trng. Ctee, 1977-82); Chm., Business in the Community, 1984-87; MP (C) Mitcham, 1950-74; Sutton, Carshalton, 1974-76; PPS to Sec. of State for Foreign Affairs, Nov. 1951-April 1955; to Prime Minister, April-Dec. 1955; Parly Sec., Min. of Labour and Nat. Service, Dec. 1955-April 1958; Sec. for Technical Co-operation, 1963-64; Sec. of State for Employment, 1970-72; Lord President of the Council and Leader of the House of Commons, April-Nov. 1972; Home Secretary, 1972-74; Governor, St Mary's Hosp., Paddington, 1958-63; Imperial Coll. of Science and Technology, 1959-63 and 1976-87 (fellow 1985); St Mary's Medical Sch. Council, 1958-63; Hon. Treas., Wright Fleming Inst. of Microbiology, 1960-63; Pres., Consultative Council of Professional Management Orgns., 1976-; Duke of Edinburgh Lectr., Inst. of Building, 1976; Pres., Surrey CCC, 1985-86; Publications: (i) One Nation, 1950; (ii) Change is our Ally, 1954; (iii) The Responsible Society, 1958; (iv) One Europe, 1965; articles in technical jls. *Recreations*: lawn tennis, music, gardening. Address: 14 North Court, Great Peter Street, SW1P 3LL. Club: Brooks's.

NEILL, Sir (Francis) Patrick, Kt 1983; QC 1966; Warden of All Souls College, Oxford, since 1977; 1st Judge of the Courts of Appeal of Jersey and Guernsey, since 1977; 8 Aug. 1926; 1st of late Sir Thomas Neill, JP, and Lady (Anne Strachan) Neill (née Unwin); m 1954, Caroline Susan, d. of late Sir Peter Debenham, 2nd Bt, and Lady (Angela) Debenham; four t. two d. Educ: Highgate Sch.; Magdalen College, Oxford (Hon. Fellow, 1988); Gibbs Law Scholar, 1949; Eldon Law Scholar, 1950; BA 1950; ICL 1951; MA 1952; Served Rifle Brigade, 1944-47 (Captain); GSO III (Training), British Troops Egypt, 1947; Fellow of All Souls, 1950-77; Sub-Warden 1972-74; Lectr. in An. Law, LSE, 1955-58; Vice-Chancellor, Oxford Univ., 1985-89; Called to the Bar, Gray's Inn, 1951; Benchers, 1971; Vice-Treas., 1989; Treas., 1990; Member, Bar Council, 1967-71, Vice-Chm., 1973-74, Chm., 1974-75; Chm., Senate of the Inns of Court and the Bar, 1974-75; 1st Recorder of the Crown Court, 1975-78; Chm., Justice—All Souls Ctee for Rev. of Admin. Law, 1978-87; Chairman: Press Council, 1978-83; DTI Ctee of Inquiry into Regulatory Arrangements at Lloyd's, 1986-87; 1st Chm., Council for the Securities Industry, 1978-85; Vice-Chm., CVCP, 1987-89; Independent Nat. Dir. Times Newspaper Holdings, 1988-; Hon. Prof. of Legal Ethics, Birmingham Univ., 1983-84; Hon. LLD Hull; Hon. DCL Oxon, 1987. Publication: *Administrative Justice: some necessary reforms*, 1988. *Recreations*: music and forestry. Address: All Souls College, Oxford OX1 4AL. T: Oxford (0865) 279379. Clubs: Athenaeum, Garrick, Beefsteak.

BLAKE, Baron 1971 (Life Peer), of Braydon, Norfolk; Robert Norman William Blake, FBA 1967; JP; Provost of The Queen's College, Oxford, 1968-87; Hon. Fellow, 1987; Pro-Vice-Chancellor, Oxford University, 1971-87; Joint Editor, Dictionary of National Biography, 1980-90; 823 Dec. 1916; 1st of William Joseph Blake and Norah Lindley Dayne, Brundall, Norfolk; m 1953, Patricia Mary, e. d. of Thomas Richard Warren, Great Plumstead, Norfolk; three d. Educ: King Edward VI Sch., Norwich; Magdalen Coll., Oxford (MA), 1st Cl. Final Honour Sch. of Modern Greek, 1938; Eldon Law Scholar, 1938; Served War of 1939-45; Royal Artillery; North African campaign, 1942; POW in Italy, 1942-44; escaped, 1944; despatches, 1944. Student and Tutor in Politics, Christ Church, Oxford, 1947-68; Censor, 1950-55; Senior Proctor, 1959-60; Ford's Lectr. in English History for 1967-68; Mem., Hebdomadal Council, 1959-81; Member: Royal Comm. on Historical Manuscripts, 1975-; (Chm., 1982-89); Bd of Trustees, BM, 1978-88; Bd. Channel 4, 1983-86; Chm., Hansard Soc. Comm. on Electoral Reform, 1975-76; Pres., Electoral Reform Soc., 1986-; Mem. (Conservative) Oxford City Council, 1957-64; Governor of Norwich Sch.; Rhodes Trustee, 1971-87 (Chm., 1983-87); Prime Warden, Dyer's Co., 1976-77; High Bailiff of Westminster Abbey and Searcher of the Sanctuary, 1988-89; High Steward of Westminster Abbey, 1989-; Hon. Student, Christ Church, Oxford, 1977; Hon. DLitt: Glasgow, 1972; East Anglia, 1983; Westminster Coll., Fulton, Mo., 1987; Buckingham, 1988. Publications: *The Private Papers of Douglas Haig*, 1952; *The Unknown Prime Minister* (Life of Andrew Bonar Law), 1955; *Durand*, 1966; *The Conservative Party from Peel to Churchill*, 1970, 2nd edn. *The Conservative Party from Peel to Thatcher*, 1985; *The Office of Prime Minister*, 1975; (ed. with John Patten) *The Conservative Opportunity*, 1976; *A History of Rhodesia*, 1977; *Durand's Grand Tour*, 1982; (ed.) *The English World*, 1982; *The Decline of Power 1915-1964*, 1985; (ed. jily) *Salisbury: the man and his policies*, 1987; (ed.) *Oxford Illustrated Encyclopedia*, Vol. 4, *World History from 1800*, 1989. Address: Riverview House, Brundall, Norfolk NR13 5LA. T: Norwich (0603) 712133. Clubs: Beefsteak, Brooks's, Pratt's, United Oxford & Cambridge University; Vincent's (Oxford); Norfolk County.